The CRNA's Role in Addressing Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Anesthesia Care

Position Statement, Policy, and Practice Considerations

Purpose

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology (AANA) believes that it is imperative for Certified Registered Nurse Anesthetists (CRNAs) to provide compassionate, holistic, patient-centered anesthesia, analgesia, pain management, and related care regardless of the patient's race, ethnicity, culture, religion, sexual orientation, or gender identity.

The purpose of this document is to highlight the impact of racial and ethnic disparities on outcomes of care and provide resources for CRNAs and facilities to develop effective policies and practices that promote equitable care for all patients.

Background

Despite advances in healthcare and technology that have tremendously improved population health, significant healthcare disparities resulting from social, economic, and environmental disadvantages continue to disproportionately affect racial and ethnic minorities in the United States. Compared to the general population, members of racial and ethnic minority groups experience greater obstacles to health insurance and access to services, which may result in worse health outcomes.[1, 2]

These disparities also exist in anesthesia care. For example, studies show compared to white women, racial and ethnic minority women are less likely to receive epidural analgesia for labor,[3] and are more likely to undergo unscheduled cesarean delivery.[4, 5] Racial and ethnic minority women are also two to three times more likely to die from pregnancy-related causes than white women.[6, 7] A longitudinal study (1999-2002) of women who underwent cesarean delivery found black women are significantly more likely to receive general anesthesia compared with white women.[8] This finding is important because of the inherent increased risk when anesthesia is provided during cesarean delivery and the decreased benefit available to the mother for immediate bonding and awareness/recall of the birth.

Racial and ethnic minorities also receive less comprehensive treatment options for acute and chronic pain compared to whites.[9-11] Additionally, black children diagnosed with appendicitis in the emergency department are less likely to receive pain medication for moderate pain and less likely to receive opioids for severe pain compared to white children.[12] Recent studies have also found that compared to white children, black and Hispanic children were more likely to receive non-opioid analgesia for moderate to severe pain from suspected appendicitis or with limb fractures.[13] Research suggests a healthcare professional's false beliefs about biological differences between blacks and whites (e.g., a false belief that whites are more sensitive to pain as compared to blacks) may contribute to disparities in pain assessment and treatment recommendations.[14, 15] This is important because CRNAs should recognize implicit biases that could cause adverse patient outcomes.

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division I 847-655-8870 I practice@aana.com

In addition to hereditary and modifiable risk factors, social determinants, such as an individual's living environment can impact health outcomes.[16-18] For example, racial and ethnic minorities who are disproportionally poor live in unstable housing with limited transportation and access to health-enhancing resources, such as healthy foods, exercise facilities, and preventative care.[19, 20] A long-standing distrust of the healthcare system due to the legacy of racism where experimental treatments and tests were conducted on minority patients without their consent or knowledge; language barriers; low health literacy; and lack of insurance and paid sick leave may also contribute to their inability to receive quality care.[21-27] Research suggests disparities transpire throughout the life course, starting before birth and continuing through mid-life, old age, and across generations.[28] Institutional and structural racism is an important factor in health disparities for racial and ethnic minorities.[28, 29]

As the diversity of the U.S. population increases, the societal cost of healthcare disparities is increasing. Recent analysis suggests consequences of disparities annually add approximately $93 billion to healthcare costs and $42 billion in lost productivity, as well as cause significant economic loss due to premature deaths.[29] As of August 2021, the American Public Health Association reported 209 declarations of racism as a public health issue across 37 states compared to only seven states that made these declarations in 2019.[30] It is critical for racism to be addressed as a public health issue in the United States to improve the health inequities in our society.[31]

Policy and Practice Considerations

CRNAs have an important role in understanding and recognizing healthcare disparities to effectively address patients' needs from diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds. Eliminating these disparities is challenging and requires a multifaceted approach by both CRNAs and facilities. Key aspects are outlined below:

- **Be a patient advocate:** CRNAs should advocate for their patients who experience racism or other instances of injustice while receiving care.
- **Be consciously aware of one's own implicit bias:**[32] CRNAs should be aware of their own implicit bias or unconscious prejudice because of its adverse impact on patient-CRNA interaction, and ultimately, patient's health outcomes. For example, some healthcare professionals may choose not to engage in a meaningful discussion of healthcare options with the patient due to their preconceived notion that the patient has limited health literacy to fully understand those options.
- **Embrace cultural humility as a life-long process**:[33, 34] Cultural humility refers to "a process of openness, self-awareness, being egoless, and incorporating self-reflection and critique after willingly interacting with diverse individuals." [33] Embracing cultural humility has many benefits, as it promotes "mutual empowerment, respect, partnerships, optimal care, and lifelong learning" that helps, in turn, build a better environment and tools to work with diverse patients, families and communities. [33, 34]
- **Be aware of the community needs**.[32] CRNAs are encouraged to better understand the communities they serve, the needs of those communities, and whether resources are available to address those needs. CRNAs may collaborate with social workers, when appropriate, to provide or refer patients to resources (e.g., sharing resources related to transportation options to get to the clinic/hospital for anesthesia follow-up or pre-op check).

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division l 847-655-8870 l practice@aana.com

- **Accommodate literacy needs and linguistic barriers of patients:**[35] Patients from racial and ethnic backgrounds are more likely than other groups to experience limited health literacy and English proficiency potentially restricting their ability to obtain, process, and understand basic health information and services needed to make appropriate health decisions.[35] AANA resource, *Informed Consent for Anesthesia Care*, includes practical recommendations on how to effectively facilitate communication with patients from diverse backgrounds.
- **Incorporate educational training on cultural competency into practice:**[32] Cultural competency education/training is essential to help CRNAs and other providers acknowledge their own biases as well as understand the dangers of racism and discrimination in healthcare. Education training should be evidence-based and taught in a non-judgmental way. It should include recommendations on how to empower patients from disadvantaged backgrounds to understand their options for anesthesia and pain management care, as well as financial and social support. CRNAs should recognize and learn from situations where underrepresented patients faced discrimination or adverse health outcomes while interacting with the healthcare system.
- **Collect health outcomes data:**[36, 37] Facilities should systematically collect data on health outcomes that include: information on race/ethnicity, income, insurance status, age, severity of health condition(s), and other essential patient characteristics.
- **Develop, implement and maintain anti-racist/anti-discrimination policies at your facility:**[38-40] Organizations and facilities must develop, implement, and maintain policies to address racism and discrimination.
- **Utilize evidence-based protocols when possible to provide patients with anesthesia and pain management care:**[41] CRNAs should consider using clinical guidelines, standardized checklists, and facility-wide protocols to help reduce bias that may influence anesthesia and pain management decisions.
- **Encourage students from culturally diverse backgrounds to consider the nurse anesthesia profession:**[42-44] Nurse anesthesia educational programs should consider strategies to attract and retain students from culturally diverse backgrounds. Research shows minority healthcare professionals are more likely to provide care to minority patients and work in underserved areas.[45] There is also evidence to suggest that patients who share the same racial or ethnic background with their healthcare professional have higher levels of satisfaction with care.[46-49]
- **Encourage nurse anesthetists from culturally diverse backgrounds to consider the role of faculty within the nurse anesthesia profession**: Nurse anesthesia educational programs should develop strategies to attract and retain CRNA educators from culturally diverse backgrounds. To increase the recruitment and retention of students within nurse anesthesia programs, students should be provided with financial and academic support, mentoring opportunities, and having a diverse faculty to provide social support to diverse students.[50]

Conclusion

Eliminating disparities in healthcare remains a critical public health priority. CRNAs can play an important role in reducing these disparities to effectively address patients' needs from diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds.

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division I 847-655-8870 I practice@aana.com

AANA
American Association of
NURSE ANESTHESIOLOGY

Glossary

Anti-racism: An active and consistent process of change to eliminate individual, institutional and systemic racism as well as the oppression and injustice racism causes.[51]
Cultural Awareness: "Being cognizant, observant, and conscious of similarities and differences among and between cultural groups."[52]

Cultural Competence: "Is the ability to collaborate effectively with individuals from different cultures; and such competence improves health care experiences and outcomes."[53]
Cultural Humility: "A process of openness, self-awareness, being egoless, and incorporating self-reflection and critique after willingly interacting with diverse individuals."[33]
Discrimination: "The unfair or prejudicial treatment of people and groups based on characteristics such as race, gender, age or sexual orientation."[39]
Diversity: "Understanding the background of employees and patients being served, including culture, gender, sexual orientation, religious beliefs, and socioeconomic status. Also, hiring and retaining a workforce that is representative of the patient population served."[54]
Health Disparity: "[A] higher burden of illness, injury, disability, or mortality experienced by one group relative to another."[29]
Healthcare Disparity: "[D]ifferences between groups in health insurance coverage, access to and use of care, and quality of care. Health and [healthcare] disparities often refer to differences that are not explained by variations in health needs, patient preferences, or treatment recommendations and are closely linked with social, economic, and/or environmental disadvantage. The terms 'health inequality' and 'inequity' also are used to refer to disparities."[29]
Health Equity: "Striving to equalize opportunities to be healthy. In accord with the other ethical principles of beneficence (doing good) and nonmalfeasance (doing no harm), equity requires concerted effort to achieve more rapid improvements among those who were worse off to start, within an overall strategy to improve everyone's health. Closing health gaps by worsening advantaged groups' health is not a way to achieve equity. Reductions in health disparities (by improving the health of the socially disadvantaged) are the metric by which progress toward health equity is measured."[55]
Implicit Bias: "Prejudice or unsupported judgments in favor of or against one thing, person, or group as compared to another, in a way that is usually considered unfair."[56] "Unconscious bias occurs automatically as the brain makes quick judgements based on past experiences and background. As a result of unconscious biases, certain people benefit and other people are penalized."[57]
Institutional Racism: "A variety of systems operating within an organization that have attitudes, behaviors, and practices that subordinate persons or groups because of race or ethnic background."[56]
Inclusion: "Giving both employees and patients a voice to help provide/receive high-quality care, and encouraging the presence of a diverse healthcare staff in the treatment experience of patients."[54]

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division I 847-655-8870 I practice@aana.com

References

1. Riley WJ. Health disparities: gaps in access, quality and affordability of medical care. *Trans Am Clin Climatol Assoc.* 2012;123:167-172; discussion 172-164.
2. Artiga S, Hill L, Damico A. Health Coverage by Race and Ethnicity, 2010-2021. *Kaiser Family Foundation*. Available at: https://www.kff.org/racial-equity-and-health-policy/issue-brief/health-coverage-by-race-and-ethnicity/. Accessed April 11, 2023.
3. Glance LG, Wissler R, Glantz C, Osler TM, Mukamel DB, Dick AW. Racial differences in the use of epidural analgesia for labor. *Anesthesiology.* Jan 2007;106(1):19-25; discussion 16-18.
4. Edmonds JK, Yehezkel R, Liao X, Moore Simas TA. Racial and ethnic differences in primary, unscheduled cesarean deliveries among low-risk primiparous women at an academic medical center: a retrospective cohort study. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth.* Sep 3 2013;13:168.
5. Huesch M, Doctor JN. Factors associated with increased cesarean risk among African American women: evidence from California, 2010. *Am J Public Health.* May 2015;105(5):956-962.
6. Racial and Ethnic Disparities Continue in Pregnancy-Related Deaths. *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention* Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/media/releases/2019/p0905-racial-ethnic-disparities-pregnancy-deaths.html. Accessed January 26, 2021.
7. Working Together to Reduce Black Maternal Mortality. *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC)*. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/healthequity/features/maternal-mortality/index.html. Accessed April 6, 2023.
8. Butwick AJ, Blumenfeld YJ, Brookfield KF, Nelson LM, Weiniger CF. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Mode of Anesthesia for Cesarean Delivery. *Anesth Analg.* Feb 2016;122(2):472-479.
9. Mossey JM. Defining racial and ethnic disparities in pain management. *Clin Orthop Relat Res.* Jul 2011;469(7):1859-1870.
10. Carey TS, Garrett JM. The relation of race to outcomes and the use of health care services for acute low back pain. *Spine (Phila Pa 1976).* Feb 15 2003;28(4):390-394.
11. Goshal M. Special Report: Race, Pain Management, and the System. *Practical Pain Management.* 2020;20(5).
12. Goyal MK, Kuppermann N, Cleary SD, Teach SJ, Chamberlain JM. Racial Disparities in Pain Management of Children With Appendicitis in Emergency Departments. *JAMA Pediatr.* Nov 2015;169(11):996-1002.
13. Guedj R, Marini M, Kossowsky J, Berde CB, Kimia AA, Fleegler EW. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Pain Management of Children With Limb Fractures or Suspected Appendicitis: A Retrospective Cross-Sectional Study. *Frontiers in Pediatrics.* 2021-August-03 2021;9.
14. Hoffman KM, Trawalter S, Axt JR, Oliver MN. Racial bias in pain assessment and treatment recommendations, and false beliefs about biological differences between blacks and whites. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A.* Apr 19 2016;113(16):4296-4301.
15. Hollingshead NA, Meints SM, Miller MM, Robinson ME, Hirsh AT. A comparison of race-related pain stereotypes held by White and Black individuals. *J Appl Soc Psychol.* Dec 2016;46(12):718-723.
16. Van Kalsbeek M, Saunders JB. Healthy People 2020: a road map for health. *NCSL Legisbrief.* Jun-Jul 2011;19(27):1-2.

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division l 847-655-8870 l practice@aana.com

17. Koh HK, Piotrowski JJ, Kumanyika S, Fielding JE. Healthy people: a 2020 vision for the social determinants approach. *Health Educ Behav.* Dec 2011;38(6):551-557.
18. Why Is Addressing Social Determinants of Health Important for CDC and Public Health? *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention*. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/about/sdoh/addressing-sdoh.html. Accessed April 11, 2023.
19. Jacobs DE. Environmental health disparities in housing. *Am J Public Health.* Dec 2011;101 Suppl 1:S115-122.
20. Hernandez D. Affording Housing at the Expense of Health: Exploring the Housing and Neighborhood Strategies of Poor Families. *J Fam Issues.* May 2016;37(7):921-946.
21. Stepanikova I, Cook KS. Effects of poverty and lack of insurance on perceptions of racial and ethnic bias in health care. *Health Serv Res.* Jun 2008;43(3):915-930.
22. Sohn H. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Health Insurance Coverage: Dynamics of Gaining and Losing Coverage over the Life-Course. *Popul Res Policy Rev.* Apr 2017;36(2):181-201.
23. Green AR, Nze C. Language-Based Inequity in Health Care: Who Is the "Poor Historian"? *AMA J Ethics.* Mar 1 2017;19(3):263-271.
24. DeRigne L, Stoddard-Dare P, Quinn L. Workers Without Paid Sick Leave Less Likely To Take Time Off For Illness Or Injury Compared To Those With Paid Sick Leave. *Health Aff (Millwood).* Mar 2016;35(3):520-527.
25. Cobb WM. The Tuskegee syphilis study. *J Natl Med Assoc.* Jul 1973;65(4):345-348.
26. Brown D. Johns Hopkins names building to honor Henrietta Lacks and her ‘immortal’ cells. *The Washington Post* October 8, 2018, 2018.
27. Rivas A. Minority communities’ distrust of COVID-19 vaccine poses challenge: abc News; 2020.
28. Jones NL, Gilman SE, Cheng TL, Drury SS, Hill CV, Geronimus AT. Life Course Approaches to the Causes of Health Disparities. *Am J Public Health.* Jan 2019;109(S1):S48-S55.
29. Artiga S, Orgera K, Pham O. Kaiser Family Foundation. Disparities in Health and Health Care: Five Key Questions and Answers. Available at: https://www.kff.org/racial-equity-and-health-policy/issue-brief/disparities-in-health-and-health-care-five-key-questions-and-answers/. Accessed April 3, 2023.
30. American Public Health Association. Declaration of Racism as a Public Health Issue. Available at: https://www.apha.org/topics-and-issues/health-equity/racism-and-health/racism-declarations. Accessed December 14, 2020.
31. Media Statement from CDC Director Rochelle P. Walensky, MD, MPH, on Racism and Health. In: CDC, ed; 2021.
32. What Is Implicit Bias, How Does It Affect Healthcare? Available at: https://patientengagementhit.com/news/what-is-implicit-bias-how-does-it-affect-healthcare. Accessed December 14, 2020.
33. Foronda C, Baptiste DL, Reinholdt MM, Ousman K. Cultural Humility: A Concept Analysis. *J Transcult Nurs.* May 2016;27(3):210-217.
34. Greene-Moton E, Minkler M. Cultural Competence or Cultural Humility? Moving Beyond the Debate. *Health Promot Pract.* Jan 2020;21(1):142-145.
35. Wasserman M, Renfrew MR, Green AR, et al. Identifying and preventing medical errors in patients with limited English proficiency: key findings and tools for the field. *J Healthc Qual.* May-Jun 2014;36(3):5-16.
36. Thorlby R, Jorgensen S, Siegel B, Ayanian JZ. How health care organizations are using data on patients' race and ethnicity to improve quality of care. *Milbank Q.* Jun 2011;89(2):226-255.

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division l 847-655-8870 l practice@aana.com

37. 5. Improving Data Collection across the Health Care System. . Available at: https://www.ahrq.gov/research/findings/final-reports/iomracereport/reldata5.html.
38. Svetaz MV, Barral R, Kelley MA, et al. Inaction Is Not an Option: Using Antiracism Approaches to Address Health Inequities and Racism and Respond to Current Challenges Affecting Youth. *J Adolesc Health.* Sep 2020;67(3):323-325.
39. Discrimination: What it is and how to cope. Available at: https://www.apa.org/topics/racism-bias-discrimination/types-stress. Accessed January 29, 2021.
40. U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Comission. Harassment. Available at: https://www.eeoc.gov/harassment. Accessed January 29, 2021.
41. Penner LA, Blair IV, Albrecht TL, Dovidio JF. Reducing Racial Health Care Disparities: A Social Psychological Analysis. *Policy Insights Behav Brain Sci.* Oct 2014;1(1):204-212.
42. Newman J, Valdes J. Teaching Anesthesia and Diversity *AANA NewsBulletin* 2019(Sept.):14-15.
43. Kilburn F, Hill L, Porter MD, Pell C. Inclusive Recruitment and Admissions Strategies Increase Diversity in CRNA Educational Programs. *AANA J.* Oct 2019;87(5):379-389.
44. Worth P. The evolution of diversity in nursing and nurse anesthesia. *AANA J.* Apr 2004;72(2):101-105.
45. Walker KO, Moreno G, Grumbach K. The association among specialty, race, ethnicity, and practice location among California physicians in diverse specialties. *J Natl Med Assoc.* Jan-Feb 2012;104(1-2):46-52.
46. Laveist TA, Nuru-Jeter A. Is doctor-patient race concordance associated with greater satisfaction with care? *J Health Soc Behav.* Sep 2002;43(3):296-306.
47. Saha S, Komaromy M, Koepsell TD, Bindman AB. Patient-physician racial concordance and the perceived quality and use of health care. *Arch Intern Med.* May 10 1999;159(9):997-1004.
48. Enhancing Diversity in the Workforce. *AACN*. Available at: https://www.aacnnursing.org/News-Information/Fact-Sheets/Enhancing-Diversity. Accessed April 6, 2023.
49. Stanford FC. The Importance of Diversity and Inclusion in the Healthcare Workforce. *J Natl Med Assoc.* Jun 2020;112(3):247-249.
50. Phillips JM, Malone B. Increasing racial/ethnic diversity in nursing to reduce health disparities and achieve health equity. *Public Health Rep.* Jan-Feb 2014;129 Suppl 2(Suppl 2):45-50.
51. Commission OHR. Appendix 1: Glossary of human rights terms. Available at: https://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/teaching-human-rights-ontario-guide-ontario-schools/appendix-1-glossary-human-rights-terms.
52. Curricula Enhancement Module Series. A project of the National Center for Cultural Competence. George Town University Center for Child and Human Development. . Available at: https://nccc.georgetown.edu/curricula/modules.html. Accessed February 1, 2021.
53. Nair L, Adetayo OA. Cultural Competence and Ethnic Diversity in Healthcare. *Plast Reconstr Surg Glob Open.* May 2019;7(5):e2219.
54. Vaughn N. How diversity, equity, and inclusion can influence healthcare. Available at: https://www.relias.com/blog/how-diversity-equity-inclusion-influence-healthcare. Accessed February 2, 2021.
55. Braveman PA, Kumanyika S, Fielding J, et al. Health disparities and health equity: the issue is justice. *Am J Public Health.* Dec 2011;101 Suppl 1:S149-155.
56. Berkley Center for Equity G, and Leadership. Glossary for Key Terms. Available at: https://haas.berkeley.edu/equity/industry/efl-knowledge-bank/glossary-of-key-terms/.

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division I 847-655-8870 I practice@aana.com

57. Unconscious Bias. *Vanderbilt University.* Available at: https://www.vanderbilt.edu/diversity/unconscious-bias/. Accessed May 10, 2024.

Revised by AANA Board of Directors May 2023
©Copyright 2021

American Association of Nurse Anesthesiology
10275 West Higgins Road, Suite 500 | Rosemont, IL 60018
Professional Practice Division l 847-655-8870 l practice@aana.com